

OFFICE OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
One Government Center, Suite 1920
May 19, 2016 2 p.m.

A regular meeting of the Toledo Civil Service Commission was held at the time and place specified above.

Present: Commission President Dr. Marjorie L. Holt
Commission Member Wilma D. Brown
Commission Member Justice G. Johnson, Jr., Esq.
Victoria Coleman, Manager-Administrative Services
Erica S. Powell, Secretary-Toledo Civil Service Commission
Kelly Murphy, Administrative Analyst 2
Joshua Curry, Administrative Analyst 1

Review and approval of minutes from Regular Meeting of May 4, 2016. A motion to approve the minutes was made, seconded and approved unanimously at the May 19, 2016 Regular Meeting.

ANNOUNCEMENTS:

- 2015-00604 Engineering Technician (NCP/NCR) announce Friday, May 20, 2016 to Friday, May 27, 2016
- 2016-00071 Engineering Associate (NCP/NCR) announce Friday, May 20, 2016 to Thursday, June 2, 2016
- 2016-00079 Supervisor-Water Reclamation Operations (CP) announce Friday, May 20, 2016 to Friday, May 27, 2016

ELIGIBLE LISTS:

- 2015-00462 Permit Technician (NCP/NCR) add Butler, Cervantes, Osmun, Sarantou and Traynoff
- 2015-00587 Water Control Room Operator (NCP/NCR) add Pino
- 2016-00008 Police Records Clerk (CR) add McClair
- 2016-00028 Clerk Specialist I (CR) add Amstutz, Ansted, Barnes, Beavers, Bester, Brown, Brown-Biddle, Brubaker, Butts, Copeland Currier, Derden, Eaton, Egnatz, Frelove, French, Frye, Greer, Havener, Heck, Hutson, Jackson, Karafa, Kemp, Lisiakowski, Lopez, Martin, Mata, McCoy, Newton, Nunnally, Peters, Pinson, Polk, Ricica, Rogers, Rost, Schweickert, Shea, Shepherd, Sherer, Stein, Theiss, Thomson, Torres, Urbina, White and Wimberly
- 2016-00082 Neighborhood Development Specialist (NCP) add Morey, Ross, Russell and Turnbough
- 2016-00612 General Foreman – Sewer Maintenance (CP) add Hanf, Futey, Harris, Wiciak and Machnicki

CLASSIFICATION REPORTS:

None

OTHER:

RCA – Disqualification of Eligible – Derek Wood (JC) (*Appearance)

There is one (1) applicant that is thirty-five (35) years of age or older on the eligible list for the position of Police Officer. Therefore, this individual exceeds the maximum hiring age for the position of Police Officer. Based on all of the facts, Staff recommends to the Commission that Derek Wood be disqualified and removed from the eligible list for the position of Police Officer, pursuant to Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.03 “Disqualification of Eligible” and Section 60.05 “Removal from Eligible List” and lastly, Civil Service Rule 40.03B “Age Limits”. It is recommended to the Commission, that Derek Wood be notified that there is just and reasonable cause to believe that he is not qualified for appointment and his name is subject to removal from the Police Officer eligibility list in accordance with Rule 60.00, Section 60.05.

After review and discussion of information presented and appearance of Mr. Derek Wood, the Commission found there was just and reasonable cause to remove Mr. Wood’s name from the Police Officer eligible list in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.05 “Removal From Eligible List” and Rule 40.03B “Age Limits”. Mr. Wood’s name will be removed from the Police Officer eligible list.

RCA – Disqualification of Eligible – Maintenance Worker I - Brent Englehart (KM) (*Appearance)

Former City of Toledo employee, Brent Englehart, applied to the position of Maintenance Worker I. Mr. Englehart previously held this position with the City of Toledo; therefore, he could potentially be placed on the competitive eligible list for the position of Maintenance Worker I. Mr. Englehart departed his employment under unfavorable circumstances that, for just and reasonable cause, indicates he should be disqualified from the recruitment process for the position of Maintenance Worker I. Based on the facts and analysis presented, it is recommended to the Commission that Mr. Brent Englehart be notified that there is just and reasonable cause to believe that he is not qualified for appointment and his name is subject to removal from the Maintenance Worker I eligible list in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.03 “Disqualification of Eligible” and Section 60.05 “Removal from Eligible List”. A hearing date will be scheduled.

After review and discussion of information presented and appearance of Mr. Brent Englehart, the Commission found there was just and reasonable cause to remove Mr. Englehart’s name from the Maintenance Worker I eligible list in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.05 “Removal From Eligible List”.

RCA – Disqualification of Eligible – Maintenance Worker I - Charley Ratliff, Jr. (KM) (*Appearance-Tabled at last meeting)

Charley Ratliff, Jr. applied to the position of Maintenance Worker I and after a review of his application, he could potentially be placed on the competitive eligible list for the position of Maintenance Worker I. Mr. Ratliff previously applied to and was conditionally offered the position of Sewer Maintenance Worker with the City of Toledo. A review of his criminal background was conducted and subsequently his conditional offer of employment for the position of Sewer Maintenance Worker was rescinded. The recent rescission of Mr. Ratliff’s offer of employment is just and reasonable cause to indicate that he should be disqualified from the recruitment process for the position of Maintenance Worker I. Based on the all of the facts and analysis presented, it is recommended to the Commission that Mr. Charley Ratliff, Jr. be notified that there is just and reasonable cause to believe that he is not qualified for appointment following certification of the eligible list, and his name is subject to removal from the Maintenance Worker I eligible list. Further, it is recommended that in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.03 “Disqualification of Eligible” and Section 60.05 “Removal from Eligible List”. A hearing date will be scheduled.

After review, discussion and appearance of Mr. Ratliff, Jr., the Commission requests that further information be presented by Staff at next meeting before a decision is made.

OTHER:

RCA – Disqualification of Eligible – Maintenance Worker I – James Todd (KM) (*Appearance)

Former City of Toledo employee, James Todd, applied to the position of Maintenance Worker I. Mr. Todd previously held this position with the City of Toledo; therefore, he could potentially be placed on the competitive eligible list for the position of Maintenance Worker I. Mr. Todd departed his employment under unfavorable circumstances that, for just and reasonable cause, indicates that he should be disqualified from the recruitment process for the position of Maintenance Worker I. Based on the facts and analysis presented, it is recommended to the Commission that Mr. Todd be notified that there is just and reasonable cause to believe that he is not qualified for appointment and his name is subject to removal from the Maintenance Worker I eligible list in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.03 “Disqualification of Eligible” and Section 60.05 “Removal from Eligible List”. A hearing date will be scheduled.

After review and discussion of information presented and appearance of Mr. James Todd, the Commission found there was just and reasonable cause to remove Mr. Todd’s name from the Maintenance Worker I eligible list in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.05 “Removal From Eligible List”.

RCA – Disqualification of Eligible – Sewer Maintenance Worker - James Todd (JC) (*Appearance)

Former City of Toledo employee, James Todd, applied to the position of Sewer Maintenance Worker. Based on the information provided in his application, Mr. Todd could potentially be placed on the competitive eligible list for the position of Sewer Maintenance Worker. Mr. Todd departed his employment under unfavorable circumstances that, for just and reasonable cause, indicates that he should be disqualified from the recruitment process for the position of Sewer Maintenance Worker. Based on the facts and analysis presented, it is recommended to the Commission that Mr. Todd be notified that there is just and reasonable cause to believe that he is not qualified for appointment and his name is subject to removal from the Sewer Maintenance Worker eligible list in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.03 “Disqualification of Eligible” and Section 60.05 “Removal from Eligible List”. A hearing date will be scheduled.

After review and discussion of information presented and appearance of Mr. James Todd, the Commission found there was just and reasonable cause to remove Mr. Todd’s name from the Sewer Maintenance Worker eligible list in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.05 “Removal From Eligible List”.

RCA – Disqualification of Eligible – Sewer Maintenance Worker – Keith Jones (JC)

Former City of Toledo employee, Keith Jones, applied to the position of Sewer Maintenance Worker. Mr. Jones previously held the position of Watermain and Service Repair Worker with the City of Toledo; therefore, he could potentially be placed on the competitive eligible list for the position of Sewer Maintenance Worker. Mr. Jones departed his employment under unfavorable circumstances that, for just and reasonable cause, indicates that he should be disqualified from the eligible list should he meet the minimum qualifications for the position of Sewer Maintenance Worker. Based on the facts and analysis presented, it is recommended to the Commission that Mr. Jones be notified that there is just and reasonable cause to believe that he is not qualified for appointment and his name is subject to removal from the Sewer Maintenance Worker eligible list in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.03 “Disqualification of Eligible” and Section 60.05 “Removal from Eligible List”. A hearing date will be scheduled.

Mr. Keith Jones did not appear before the Commission. Therefore, after review and discussion and pursuant to Civil Service Rule 110.03(h) “Conduct of Hearings”, the Commission agreed to have his name removed from the Sewer Maintenance Worker eligibility list in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.05.

OTHER: (Continued)

RCA – Disqualification of Eligible – Sewer Maintenance Worker – George Taylor (JC) (*Appearance)

Former City of Toledo employee, George Taylor, applied to the position of Sewer Maintenance Worker and could potentially be placed on the competitive eligible list. Mr. Taylor departed his employment under unfavorable circumstances that, for just and reasonable cause, indicate that he should be disqualified from the eligible list in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.03 “Disqualification of Eligible” and Section 60.05 “Removal from Eligible List”. A hearing date will be scheduled.

After review and discussion of information presented and appearance of Mr. George Taylor, the Commission found there was just and reasonable cause to remove Mr. Taylor’s name from the Sewer Maintenance Worker eligible list in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.05 “Removal From Eligible List”.

RCA – Disqualification of Eligible – Sewer Maintenance Worker – Brent Englehart (JC) (*Appearance)

Former City of Toledo employee, Brent Englehart, applied to the position of Sewer Maintenance Worker. Based on the information provided in his application, Mr. Englehart could potentially be placed on the competitive eligible list for the position of Sewer Maintenance Worker. Mr. Englehart departed his employment under unfavorable circumstances that, for just and reasonable cause, indicates he should be disqualified from the recruitment process for the position of Sewer Maintenance Worker. Based on the facts and analysis presented, it is recommended to the Commission that Mr. Englehart be notified that there is just and reasonable cause to believe that he is not qualified for appointment and his name is subject to removal from the Sewer Maintenance Worker eligible list in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.03 “Disqualification of Eligible” and Section 60.05 “Removal from Eligible List”. A hearing date will be scheduled.

After review and discussion of information presented and appearance of Mr. Brent Englehart, the Commission found there was just and reasonable cause to remove Mr. Englehart’s name from the Sewer Maintenance Worker eligible list in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.05 “Removal From Eligible List”.

RCA – Disqualification of Eligible – Meter Reader – Brent Englehart (JC) (*Appearance)

Former City of Toledo employee, Brent Englehart, applied to the position of Meter Reader. Based on the information provided in his application, Mr. Englehart could potentially be placed on the competitive eligible list for the position of Meter Reader. Mr. Englehart departed his employment under unfavorable circumstances that, for just and reasonable cause, indicates he should be disqualified from the recruitment process for the position of Meter Reader. Based on the facts and analysis presented, it is recommended to the Commission that Mr. Englehart be notified that there is just and reasonable cause to believe that he is not qualified for appointment and his name is subject to removal from the Meter Reader eligible list in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.03 “Disqualification of Eligible” and Section 60.05 “Removal from Eligible List”. A hearing date will be scheduled.

After review and discussion of information presented and appearance of Mr. Brent Englehart, the Commission found there was just and reasonable cause to remove Mr. Englehart’s name from the Meter Reader eligible list in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.05 “Removal From Eligible List”.

OTHER: (Continued)

RCA – Disqualification of Eligible – Senior Utility Worker – Brent Englehart (JC) (*Appearance)

Former City of Toledo employee, Brent Englehart, applied to the position of Senior Utility Worker. Based on the information provided in his application, Mr. Englehart could potentially be placed on the competitive eligible list for the position of Senior Utility Worker. Mr. Englehart departed his employment under unfavorable circumstances that, for just and reasonable cause, indicates he should be disqualified from the recruitment process for the position of Senior Utility Worker. Based on the facts and analysis presented, it is recommended to the Commission that Mr. Englehart be notified that there is just and reasonable cause to believe that he is not qualified for appointment and his name is subject to removal from the Senior Utility Worker eligible list in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.03 “Disqualification of Eligible” and Section 60.05 “Removal from Eligible List”. A hearing date will be scheduled.

After review and discussion of information presented and appearance of Mr. Brent Englehart, the Commission found there was just and reasonable cause to remove Mr. Englehart’s name from the Senior Utility Worker eligible list in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.05 “Removal From Eligible List”.

RCA – Disqualification of Eligible – Safety and Training Specialist – Scott Redway (*Further Information Needed) (JC)

Scott Redway, current City of Toledo employee applied to the position of Safety and Training Specialist (Utilities Administration). Mr. Redway’s application was rejected for not meeting the minimum education and experience requirements. After he received his rejection email, he submitted an appeal and provided many documents and letters of personal support that would potentially allow his appeal to be approved and his name to be placed on the non-competitive eligible list for the position of Safety and Training Specialist. However, Mr. Redway is in a Last Chance Agreement with AFSCME Local 7 which states that Mr. Redway shall not be eligible for promotion or transfer during his time in the Last Chance Agreement. Therefore, there is just and reasonable cause that Mr. Redway should be disqualified from the recruitment process for the position of Safety and Training Specialist (Utilities Administration).

After further review and additional information presented by Staff, the Commission found there was just and reasonable cause to remove Mr. Redway’s name from the Safety and Training Specialist (Utilities Administration) eligible list in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.05 “Removal From Eligible List”.

RCA – Request for Reinstatement – Marques Fobbs (AS)

Marques Fobbs submitted a request for reinstatement to the classification of Administrative Specialist 3 on April 20, 2016 and is timely. Mr. Fobbs began his employment with the City of Toledo on February 29, 2008. Mr. Fobbs resigned in good standing from his position in the Office of Diversity and Inclusion (formerly the Department of Affirmative Action/Contract Compliance) effective December 14, 2015. In addition, Mr. Fobbs also held the permanent positions of Contract Compliance Specialist and Clerk 1. Based on the foregoing information, it is recommended that the Commission approve Mr. Fobb’s placement on the reinstatement list for Administrative Specialist 3, Contract Compliance Specialist and Clerk 1 pursuant to Civil Service Rule 60.17.

After review and discussion, the Commission approved Mr. Fobb’s request to be placed on the reinstatement list for Administrative Specialist 3, Clerk 1 and Contract Compliance Specialist pursuant to Civil Service Rule 60.17.

OTHER: (Continued)

RCA – Remove Names from Consideration for Police Data Entry Clerk and Police Records Clerk (KM)

Nikki Giovanni was added to the eligible list for the position of Police Data Entry Clerk on March 19, 2016 and Police Records Clerk on May 5, 2016. Ms. Giovanni emailed this office on Tuesday, May 10, 2016 requesting that her name be removed from the Police Data Entry Clerk and Police Records Clerk eligible lists. Staff recommends that Ms. Nikki Giovanni's name be removed from the certified eligible lists per her request and pursuant to Civil Service Rule 60.05 "Removal from Eligible List".

After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request of Ms. Giovanni to have her name removed from the certified eligible list for Police Data Entry Clerk and Police Records Clerk.

RCA – Request to Retest for Clerical Skills Test – Clerk Specialist I – Suzanne Copsey (KM)

Suzanne Copsey completed the clerical skills test on Monday, May 9, 2016 for the position of Clerk Specialist I. Prior to leaving the clerical skills test, Ms. Copsey completed a protest sheet requesting to retake the typing portion of the skills test. Based upon the information presented, Staff recommends that her request to retake the keyboarding test be denied.

After review and discussion, the Commission denied the request of Ms. Copsey to retake the keyboarding test for Clerk Specialist I.

RCA – Rejection of Application for Clerk Specialist I – Cheryl McClellan (KM)

Cheryl McClellan's application for Clerk Specialist I was rejected due to not completing the required clerical skills test for the classification of Clerk Specialist I. Based on the information provided, Staff recommends that Ms. McClellan's appeal be denied and the rejection of her application is upheld for not completing the required clerical skills test for the position of Clerk Specialist I.

After review and discussion, the Commission denied the appeal of Ms. McClellan and upheld the rejection of her application because she failed to complete the required clerical skills test for the position of Clerk Specialist I.

RCA – Informational Purposes – Watermain and Service Repair Worker (JC)

The posting for Watermain and Service Repair Worker was approved at the May 4, 2016 Civil Service Commission meeting. As of Friday, May 13, 2016, there were only three (3) qualified applicants. The Division of Water Distribution currently has four (4) vacancies for this position. Therefore, due to the number of vacancies being greater than the number of qualified applicants, the Division has requested that the posting be extended for an additional two (2) weeks. Therefore, Staff extended the posting for Watermain and Service Repair Worker until Saturday, May 28, 2016.

After review and discussion, the Commission approved Staff's extension of the posting for Watermain and Service Repair Worker until Saturday, May 28, 2016.

RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application Watermain and Service Repair Worker – Christopher Tesch (JC)

The application for Mr. Christopher Tesch for Watermain and Service Repair Worker was rejected for not meeting the minimum requirements of possessing a valid Class B Commercial Driver's License. Based on the information received, Staff recommends to the Commission that his appeal be denied and uphold the rejection of his application stating he does not meet the minimum requirement of possessing a Class B Commercial Driver's License for the position of Watermain and Service Repair Worker.

After review and discussion, the Commission denied the appeal of Mr. Christopher Tesch and upheld the rejection of his application stating he does not meet the minimum requirement of possessing a Class B Commercial Driver's License for the position of Watermain and Service Repair Worker.

OTHER: (Continued)

RCA – Request for a Late Application for Supervisor –Waterworks Maintenance – Brian Homer (JC)

Brian Homer is a current city employee working as a Foreman at the Division of Water Distribution. Mr. Homer is requesting to submit a late application for the position of Supervisor-Waterworks Maintenance, which is a pay grade 11 and Foreman-Water Distribution System is a pay grade 9. Mr. Homer could have contacted Human Resources Staff when he encountered computer difficulties to assist him applying for this position; however, he did not. He only contacted Human Resources after the interviews for Supervisor-Waterworks Maintenance had taken place and other employees inquired why he did not apply. Therefore, Staff recommends that Mr. Homer’s request to submit a late application be denied.

After review and discussion, the Commission denied the request of Mr. Homer to submit a late application for the position of Supervisor – Waterworks Maintenance in the Division of Water Treatment.

RCA – Clerical Skills Test – Clerk Specialist I (KM)

The following individuals completed clerical skills tests on Monday, May 9, 2016, Tuesday, May 10, 2016, Wednesday, May 11, 2016 and Thursday, May 12, 2016 for the position of Clerk Specialist I. A passing score for Clerk Specialist I is 30 wpm. (An * denotes a passing score.)

<u>Name</u>	<u>Score</u>
Amstutz, Kelleryn	73*
Ansted, Gina	34*
Barringer, Monique	17
Beavers, Diane	45*
Bester, Damita	39*
Brown, Lori	47*
Brown-Biddle, LaKeshia	32*
Brubaker, Kevin	53*
Butts, Ciara	33*
Copeland, Raquel	55*
Copsey, Suzanne	19
Currier, Kimberly	65*
Daniels, Rosetta	25
Daniels, Grace	21
Derden, Barbara	45*
Eaton, Christine	35*
Flesh, Alex	18
Forney, Tama	28
Freelove, Carla	40*
French, Ashlee	63*
Guzman, April	20
Heck, Kerri	43*
Jackson, Darryl	41*
Johnson, Johnnetta	29
Kemp, Latesha	30*
Long, Elise	29
Mata, Olivia	44*

(continued on next page)

RCA – Clerical Skills Test – Clerk Specialist I (KM) (continued)

<u>Name</u>	<u>Score</u>
McWilliams, Tazamisha	29
Newton, Sara	35*
Nunnally, Jeanette	46*
Pierce, Lindsey	17
Pinson, Loree	38*
Ricica, Karen	46*
Rogers, Cortney	32*
Rost, Amanda	32*
Rowland, Lori	26
Schweickert, Barbara	34*
Shea, Heather	44*
Stein, Michael	33*
Thomson, Nicole	34*
Urbina, Heather	30*
Wood, Ashley	27

It is recommended that the above scores be approved and placed on record for two (2) years as provided for in the Civil Service Skills Testing Policy.

After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request as recommended. Scores will be placed on record for two (2) years as provided for in the Civil Service Skills Testing Policy.

RCA – Clerical Skills Test – Police Records Clerk (KM)

The following individuals completed a typing test for the position of Police Records Clerk. A passing score for Police Records Clerk is 30 wpm. (An * denotes a passing score.)

Date	Last Name	First Name	Score
05/05/2016	McClair	Amber	56*
05/06/2016	Temple	Ashley	29

It is recommended that the above scores be approved and placed on record for two (2) years as provided for in the Civil Service Skills Testing Policy.

After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request as recommended. Scores will be placed on record for two (2) years as provided for in the Civil Service Skills Testing Policy.

INFORMATIONAL PURPOSES:

None

APPEARANCES:

Derek Wood
Brent Englehart
James Todd
Charley Ratliff, Jr. -*pending additional information
George Taylor
Keith Jones – No Show

After the appearance of one (1) candidate, the Commission upheld the disqualification from eligible list for the position of Police Officer, and removal of Mr. Wood's name from the Police Officer eligible list due to exceeding the maximum age requirement for appointment to the position of Police Officer in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.03, 60.05 and 40.03B.

In addition, the Commission upheld the disqualification from eligible list for three (3) applicants for the positions of Maintenance Worker I, Sewer Maintenance Worker I, Meter Reader, Sr. Utility Worker and Watermain and Service Repair Worker and removal of their names from said eligible lists in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.03 and 60.05.

After review, discussion and appearance of Mr. Ratliff, Jr., the Commission requests that further information be presented by Staff at next meeting before a decision is made.

EXTENSIONS:

None

HEARINGS:

None

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 3:15 p.m.