

**OFFICE OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
One Government Center, Suite 1920  
March 21, 2018 2:00 p.m.**

A regular meeting of the Toledo Civil Service Commission was held at the time and place specified above.

Present: Commission President Dr. Marjorie L. Holt  
Commission Member Wilma D. Brown  
Commission Member Justice G. Johnson, Jr., Esq.  
Victoria Coleman, Manager – Administrative Services  
Erica S. Powell, Secretary-Toledo Civil Service Commission  
Kelly Murphy, Administrative Analyst 2  
Joshua Curry, Administrative Analyst 2  
Abby Emlinger, Administrative Analyst 2

**Review and approval of minutes from Regular Meeting March 7, 2018. A motion to approve the minutes was made, seconded and approved unanimously at the March 21, 2018 Regular Meeting.**

---

**ANNOUNCEMENTS:**

2017-00368 Secretary 2 (CP) announce from Thursday, March 22, 2018 to Thursday, April 5, 2018  
2018 -00001 Automotive Repair Technician (CR) announce Thursday, March 22, 2018 to Friday, April 20, 2018  
2018-00038 Administrative Technician 2 (NCP/NCR) announce Thursday, March 22, 2018 to Saturday, March 31, 2018  
2018 -00033 Supervisor-Communications (NCP) announce Thursday, March 22, 2018 to Monday, March 26, 2018

**ELIGIBLE LISTS:**

2017-00149 Water Loss Equipment Technician (CP) add Wise, Franks, Futey Jr., Zakorczeny, Braswell, and Rivas  
2017-00306 Tree Service Worker (CR) add Lampros, Kromenacker, Scott and Lewandowski  
2017-00350 Construction Technician (CP/CR) add Allam, Bost, Conley, Denis, Dickman, Mann Jr., McQuade, Serres  
2017-00372 Vehicle Parts Storekeeper (CP/CR) add Stein, O'Rourke, Duke, Marek, Horen and Tracy  
2017-00377 Automotive Service Worker (CR) add McKinney, Toda, Niefer, Sullivan, Reddick, Spitulski and White  
2018-00001 Automotive Repair Technician (CP) add Ramirez  
2018-00015 Plumber-Steamfitter (Facility Operations) (NCR) add Baldwin and Green

**CLASSIFICATION REPORTS:**

Secretary 2 (Revise) (JC) - **Approved**

Supervisor – Communications (New) (Toledo Fire and Rescue) (AS) - **Approved**

Reclassify One (1) Vacant Administrative Technician 2 to Clerk Specialist II (Toledo Fire & Rescue Dept.) (EP) - **Approved**

Reclassify Secretary 2 to Administrative Technician 1 & (Revise) (Toledo Fire & Rescue Dept.) (EP) - **Approved**

**OTHER:**

RCA – Firefighter Thomas Williams Appeal of Suspension Days (AE) - **Denied**

Proposed Amendments to Background Assessment Standards for the positions of Police Officer and Fire Fighter (VC) - **Approved**

**OTHER:**

**RCA – Informational Purposes – Utility Worker Posting (JC)**

The Civil Service Commission approved the posting for Utility Worker at its March 7, 2018 meeting. The posting was from Thursday, March 8, 2018 to Thursday, March 15, 2018. As of March 15, 2018 only 37 applicants had applied to the position. In the past, Utility Worker postings have attracted over 100 applications and the eligible list that would be established would be used for multiple Divisions for up to two (2) years. Currently, the Divisions of Water Treatment, Water Reclamation, and Sewer and Drainage Services all have multiple vacancies to be filled. Due to relatively low number of applications received for this position in one week, Staff extended the posting until Wednesday, March 21, 2018.

**After review and discussion, the Commission agreed with Staff’s decision to extend the posting until Wednesday, March 21, 2018.**

**RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Water Emergency Repair Worker – Brandon Cantwell (JC)**

Brandon Cantwell appealed the rejection of his application for Water Emergency Repair due not meeting the minimum experience requirements. Based upon the information provided, Staff recommends that Mr. Cantwell’s Utility Locating experience be taken into consideration and that the Commission grant his appeal, deeming his application as qualified for the position of Water Emergency Repair Worker.

**After review and discussion, the Commission granted Mr. Cantwell’s appeal and deemed his application as qualified for the position of Water Emergency Repair Worker.**

**RCA – Disqualification of Eligible – Maintenance Worker I – Annette Carter (KM)**

Annette Carter applied to the position of Maintenance Worker I and after a review of her application, she could potentially be placed on the competitive eligible list for the position of Maintenance Worker I. Ms. Carter previously applied to and was conditionally offered the position of Maintenance Worker I with the City of Toledo. A review of her criminal background was conducted and subsequently her conditional offer of employment for Maintenance Worker I was rescinded. Based on the information presented, there is just and reasonable cause for the Commission to notify Ms. Carter of her potential disqualification from the recruitment process for the position of Maintenance Worker I pursuant to Rule 60.00, Section 60.03. A hearing will be scheduled.

**After review and discussion, the Commission agreed that there is just and reasonable cause to believe that Ms. Carter should be disqualified from the Maintenance Worker I eligible list pursuant to Rule 60.00, Section 60.03 and 60.05. Ms. Carter’s name will be removed from the Maintenance Worker I eligible list.**

**RCA – Request to Submit a Late Application for Senior Utility Worker – Eric Davis (KM)**

Eric Davis is requesting to submit a late application for the position of Senior Utility Worker. Staff recommends that Mr. Davis’ request to submit a late application be denied.

**After review and discussion, the Commission denied Mr. Davis’ request to submit a late application.**

**RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Landscape Maintenance Worker – Robert Jackson (KM)**

Robert Jackson’s application for Landscape Maintenance Worker was rejected for not meeting the minimum experience requirements. Based on the information received from Mr. Jackson, Staff recommends that the Commission uphold the rejection of Mr. Jackson’s application stating that he does not meet the minimum requirements for the position of Landscape Maintenance Worker.

**After review and discussion, the Commission denied Mr. Jackson’s appeal and upheld the rejection of his application stating he does not meet the minimum requirements for the position of Landscape Maintenance Worker.**

**OTHER:**

**RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Landscape Maintenance Worker – Nick Ruggiero (KM)**

Nick Ruggiero's application for Landscape Maintenance Worker was rejected for not meeting the minimum experience requirements. Based on the information received from Mr. Ruggiero, Staff recommends that the Commission grant Mr. Ruggiero's appeal and deem his application as qualified for the position of Landscape Maintenance Worker.

**After review and discussion, the Commission granted Mr. Ruggiero's appeal and deemed his application as qualified for the position of Landscape Maintenance Worker.**

**RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Landscape Maintenance Worker – Tamiko Scott Bell (KM)**

Tamiko Scott Bell's application for Landscape Maintenance Worker was rejected for not meeting the minimum experience requirements. Based on the information received from Mr. Scott Bell, Staff recommends that the appeal of Mr. Scott Bell be approved stating that he meets the minimum requirements for the position of Landscape Maintenance Worker.

**After review and discussion, the Commission approved the appeal of Mr. Scott Bell and deemed his application as qualified stating that he now meets the minimum requirements for the position of Landscape Maintenance Worker.**

**RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Landscape Maintenance Worker – Zachary Shock (KM)**

Zachary Shock's application for Landscape Maintenance Worker was rejected for not meeting the minimum experience requirements. Based on the information received from Mr. Shock, Staff recommends that the appeal of Mr. Shock be denied and the rejection of his application is upheld for failing to meet the minimum experience requirements for the position of Landscape Maintenance Worker.

**After review and discussion, the Commission denied Mr. Shock's appeal and upheld the rejection of his application for failing to meet the minimum experience requirements for the position of Landscape Maintenance Worker.**

**RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Senior Landscape Maintenance Worker – Nick Ruggiero (KM)**

Nick Ruggiero's application for Senior Landscape Maintenance Worker was rejected for not meeting the minimum experience requirements. Based on the information received from Mr. Ruggiero, Staff recommends that the Commission grant Mr. Ruggiero's appeal and deem his application as qualified for the position of Senior Landscape Maintenance Worker.

**After review and discussion, the Commission granted Mr. Ruggiero's appeal and deemed his application as qualified for the position of Senior Landscape Maintenance Worker.**

**RCA – Disqualification of Eligible – Landscape Maintenance Worker - Michael Skotynsky (KM)**

Former City of Toledo employee, Michael Skotynsky applied to the position of Landscape Maintenance Worker and after a review of his application; he could potentially be placed on the competitive eligible list for the position of Landscape Maintenance Worker. Mr. Skotynsky was terminated from his employment with the City of Toledo; therefore, there is just and reasonable cause that he should be disqualified from the recruitment process for the position of Landscape Maintenance Worker. Based on the information presented, there is just and reasonable cause for the Commission to notify Mr. Skotynsky of his potential disqualification from the recruitment process for the position of Landscape Maintenance Worker pursuant to Rule 60.00, Section 60.03. A hearing will be scheduled.

**After review and discussion, the Commission agrees that there is just and reasonable cause to notify Mr Skotynsky of his potential disqualification from the recruitment process for the position of Landscape Maintenance Worker pursuant to Rule 60.00, Section 60.03. A hearing will be scheduled.**

**OTHER:**

**RCA – Remove names from consideration for Police Officer (KM)**

On Wednesday, January 24, 2018, the names listed in the memo were added to the eligible list for the position of Police Officer. When the candidates were contacted for the background/physical ability process, some of the candidates requested to be removed from the eligibility list. Based upon Civil Service Rule 60.05 Removal from Eligible List, Staff recommends that the four (4) names be removed from the certified eligible list for Police Officer.

Also, names listed on memo were added to eligible list; however, they failed to contact their background investigators. They were called and emailed by their investigator once they missed their appointment and they have failed to respond. Staff recommends that the seven (7) names listed in memo be removed from the certified eligible list per Civil Service Rule 60.05 Removal from Eligible List.

**After review and discussion, the Commission approved the eleven (11) names to be removed from the certified Police Officer eligible list due candidate requests to be removed and/or failure to respond to their background investigators, pursuant to Civil Service Rule 60.05.**

**RCA – Re-Activate Eligible List – Environmental Services Technician (EP)**

The non-competitive promotional and non-competitive recruitment eligible lists for the position of Environmental Services Technician was established by the Civil Service Commission on September 6, 2017 and expired on March 6, 2018. The Division of Environmental Services is requesting that the Environmental Services Technician eligible list be re-activated for six (6) months due to a current employee who has been off work on an extended leave of absence. Therefore, Staff is requesting the Environmental Services Technician eligible lists be re-activated for six (6) months. If approved, the eligible lists would expire September 21, 2018.

**After review and discussion, the Commission approved the Environmental Services Technician eligible list to be re-activated for six (6) months. The list will expire September 21, 2018.**

**RCA – Rejection of Application for Planner – Nicholas Keeling (EP)**

Nicholas Keeling's application for Planner was rejected for not meeting the minimum education and experience requirements. Based on the information received from Mr. Keeling, Staff recommends that the Commission deny his appeal and uphold the rejection of his application for the position of Planner for failing to meet the minimum education and experience requirements.

**After review and discussion, the Commission denied Mr. Keeling's appeal and upheld the rejection of his application for failing to meet the minimum education and experience requirements.**

**RCA – Rejection of Application for Planner – Benjamin Coyle (EP)**

Benjamin Coyle's application for Planner was rejected for not meeting the minimum education and experience requirements. Based on the information received from Mr. Coyle, Staff recommends that the Commission deny his appeal and uphold the rejection of his application for the position of Planner for failing to meet the minimum education and experience requirements.

**After review and discussion, the Commission denied Mr. Coyle's appeal and upheld the rejection of his application stating he does not meet the minimum education and experience requirements.**

**OTHER:**

**RCA – Rejection of Application for Construction Technician – Timothy Davidson (EP)**

Timothy Davidson’s application was rejected for not meeting the minimum experience requirements. Based on the information received from Mr. Davidson, Staff recommends that the Commission grant Mr. Davidson’s appeal and deem his application as qualified for the position of Construction Technician.

**After review and discussion, the Commission granted Mr. Davidson’s appeal and deemed his application as qualified for the position of Construction Technician.**

**RCA – Rejection of Application for Construction Technician – Bridgette Turner (EP)**

Bridgette Turner’s application for Construction Technician was rejected for not meeting the minimum experience requirements. Based on the information received from Ms. Turner, Staff recommends that the Commission deny her appeal and uphold the rejection of her application for failing to meet the minimum experience requirements for the position of Construction Technician.

**After review and discussion, the Commission denied Ms. Turner’s appeal and upheld the rejection of her application for failing to meet the minimum experience requirements for the position of Construction Technician.**

**INFORMATIONAL PURPOSES:**

2018 Police Officer Pre-Assessment Background Appeals Hearings - tentatively scheduled for Wednesday, April 4, 2018

**APPEARANCES:**

None

**EXTENSIONS:**

None

**HEARINGS:**

None

**There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 2:55 p.m.**