

**OFFICE OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
One Government Center, Suite 1920
May 16, 2018 2:00 p.m.**

A regular meeting of the Toledo Civil Service Commission was held at the time and place specified above.

Present: Commission President Dr. Marjorie L. Holt
Commission Member Wilma D. Brown
Commission Member Justice G. Johnson, Jr., Esq.
Victoria Coleman, Manager – Administrative Services
Erica S. Powell, Secretary-Toledo Civil Service Commission
Kelly Murphy, Administrative Analyst 2
Joshua Curry, Administrative Analyst 2
Angie Seiple, Administrative Analyst 2

Review and approval of minutes from Regular Meeting May 2, 2018. A motion to approve the minutes was made, seconded and approved unanimously at the May 16, 2018 Regular Meeting.

ANNOUNCEMENTS:

- 2018-00077 Senior Water Treatment Maintenance Worker (CP) announce Thursday, May 17, 2018 to Thursday, May 24, 2018
- 2017-00208 Bridge Mechanic (NCP/NCR) announce Thursday, May 17, 2018 to Saturday, June 2, 2018
- 2018-00006 Maintenance Worker I (CP/CR) announce Thursday, May 17, 2018 to Saturday, June 2, 2018
- 2018-00099 Administrator-Administrative Services 1 (Taxation) (NCP/NCR) announce Thursday, May 17, 2018 to Saturday, May 26, 2018

ELIGIBLE LISTS:

- 2017-00240 Construction Inspector (CP) add Hanf, Leonard, and Scottbell
- 2016-00019 Watermain and Service Repair Worker (CR) add Rodriguez
- 2016-00234 Utility Worker (CR) add 62 names (see attached)
- 2017-00065 Traffic Technician (NCP/NCR) add Bischoff, Campbell, Close, Gould, Hess, Horton, Howard, Jackson, Kostecky, Lampley, Luckey, Miracola, Narges, Rice, Ross, Schultz, Schumann, Sharafa, Singhal, Smith, Stevens, Wagoner, Ware, Webb and Young
- 2018-00015 Plumber-Steamfitter (Facility Operation) (NC) add Saterthwaite
- 2018-00054 Police Communications Specialist (CP/CR) add Permar K, Permar A, Dale, Cole, Childress, Zunk, Purvina, Frey, Nelson, Conti, Gray El, Moore, Waldrop, Parker, Hoffman, Smith, Schmidlin, Graham, Kennedy, Lynch, Mariano, White C, Wieczorek, Ammerman, Carter, Johnson, Martin, Hudnall, Hurt, Duncan, Morrow, Reef, Walter, Clark, Jaeger, Shea, Harwick, Bricker, Craft, Miller, Ellis-Manning, Brentlinger, Buehrer, Guilford, Hunt, Sanders, Gist, Good, Walters, Vargyas, Cufu, Knaggs, Anderson, Akpaka, Box, Noles, Cameron, Easter, Searcy, White T, Williams-Adams, Pecina, Moreland, Rickner, Awada, Zylka, Allen, Greely, Studldreher, Tyson, Garcia, Lewandowski, and Fleig
- 2018-00068 Manager – Public Services (Parks & Recreation) (NCP) add Contreras-Harris, Kennedy, O'Brien, Ohl, Warnka and Wood

ELIGIBLE LISTS: (cont'd)

2018-00040 Traffic Aide (CR) add Haythorne, Moore, Pratt, Hill, Kennie Jr., Mariano, Graalman, Phalen, Stevens, Searcy, Savage, Walters, Stewart, Rice, Ruggiero, Childress

2018-00067 Secretary 2 (CR) add Ali, Large, Lee, Martinez, Merritt and Smith

2018-00063 Senior Chemist/Bacteriologist (NCP) add Timbrook

CLASSIFICATION REPORTS:

Safety and Training Specialist (Revise) (Division of Streets, Bridges and Harbor) (AS) - **Approved**

Reclassification Three (3) General Inspectors to Code Compliance Inspector I and Five (5) Building Inspectors – Property Maintenance and Zoning Inspectors to Code Compliance Inspector II (Division of Code Enforcement) (EP) - **Approved**

OTHER:

RCA – Disqualification of Eligible – Police Communications Specialist – Barbara Dickerson (KM)

Former City of Toledo employee, Barbara Dickerson, has applied to the position of Police Communications Specialist. Ms. Dickerson departed her employment under unfavorable circumstances; therefore, there is just and reasonable cause that she should be disqualified from the recruitment process for the position of Police Communications Specialist. Based on the information presented, there is just and reasonable cause for the Commission to notify Ms. Dickerson of her potential disqualification from the recruitment process for the position of Police Communications Specialist pursuant to Rule 60.00, Section 60.03. A hearing will be scheduled.

After review and discussion, the Commission agreed that there is just and reasonable cause to notify Ms. Dickerson of her potential disqualification from the recruitment process for the position of Police Communications Specialist pursuant to Rule 60.00, Section 60.03. A hearing will be scheduled.

After further review, discussion and appearance by Ms. Dickerson, the Civil Service Commission determined pursuant to Rule 60.00, Section 60.03 and 60.05, that she is disqualified for appointment to the position of Police Communications Specialist.

RCA – Disqualification of Eligible – Police Communications Specialist – Jeffrey Comstock (KM)

Former City of Toledo employee, Jeffrey Comstock, has applied to the position of Police Communications Specialist. Mr. Comstock departed his employment under unfavorable circumstances; therefore, there is just and reasonable cause that he should be disqualified from the recruitment process for the position of Police Communications Specialist. The several disciplines that were issued to Mr. Comstock are just and reasonable cause for the Commission to notify him of his potential disqualification and removal from the recruitment process for the position of Police Communications Specialist pursuant to Rule 60.00, Section 60.03. A hearing will be scheduled.

After review and discussion, the Commission agreed that there is just and reasonable cause to notify Mr. Comstock of his potential disqualification from the recruitment process for the position of Police Communications Specialist pursuant to Rule 60.00, Section 60.03. A hearing will be scheduled.

After further review, discussion and based on the fact that Mr. Comstock failed to appear, the Commission determined that he is disqualified for appointment to the position of Police Communications Specialist pursuant to Rule 60.00 Section 60.03 60.05 and Rule 110.03(h).

OTHER:

RCA – Rejection of Application for Manager-Public Services (Parks & Recreation) – Mrs. Alicia Smith (KM)

Alicia Smith's application for Manager-Public Services was rejected due to not meeting the minimum education requirements. Based on the information provided in her letter of appeal, Staff recommends that the appeal for Ms. Smith be granted and the Commission deems her qualified for the position of Manager-Public Services (Parks & Recreation), additionally, placing her name on the eligible list.

After review and discussion, the Commission granted her appeal and deemed Mrs. Alicia Smith's application as qualified for the position of Manager – Public Services (Parks & Recreation).

RCA – Water Loss Equipment Technician Eligible List (JC)

The competitive promotional eligible list for Water Loss Equipment Technician was established on March 21, 2018 with six (6) names. The eligible list was ranked based on scores from structured oral interviews that were held on March 12, 2018 with those six (6) candidates. The top three (3) candidates were sent promotion offers and all three (3) accepted. As a result of grievance resolution discussions with representatives from the Law Department and Field Operations, Staff recommends to the Commission that Michael Franks, Kenneth Futey, Jr. and Joel Zakorczyeny be notified that there is just and reasonable cause for their names to be removed from the Water Loss Equipment Technician eligible list pursuant to Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.03. A hearing will be scheduled.

After review and discussion, the Commission agreed that there is just and reasonable cause to notify Mr. Franks, Mr. Kenneth Futey, Jr. and Mr. Joel Zakorczyeny of their potential disqualification from the promotional process for the position of Water Loss Equipment Technician.

RCA – Extension of Foreman-Sewer Construction and Maintenance Eligible List (JC)

The eligible list for the position of Foreman – Sewer Construction and Maintenance was established on May 17, 2017 and is set to expire May 17, 2018. The Division would like to fill this vacancy from the current eligible list; however, due to Local 7 contract language, they need to wait until the newly promoted General Foreman has completed their probationary period. This would prevent a bumping scenario. Therefore, the Division of Sewer and Drainage Services requests that the Foreman – Sewer Construction and Maintenance eligible list be extended for six (6) months. If approved, the Foreman – Sewer Construction and Maintenance eligible list would then expire on November 17, 2018.

After review and discussion, the Commission approved the Foreman-Sewer Construction and Maintenance eligible list to be extended for six (6) months and will expire on November 17, 2018.

RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Supervisor – Utilities Administration – Sarah Horen (JC)

The application for Ms. Sarah Horen for Supervisor – Utilities Administration was rejected for not meeting the minimum experience requirements. Based on the information provided, Staff recommends Ms. Horen's appeal be denied and uphold the rejection of her application stating she does not meet the minimum experience requirements for the position of Supervisor – Utilities Administration.

After review and discussion, the Commission denied Ms. Horen's appeal and upheld the rejection of her application stating she does not meet the minimum experience requirements for the position of Supervisor – Utilities Administration.

OTHER:

RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Supervisor – Utilities Administration – Kristen Angelo (JC)

The application for Ms. Kristen Angelo for Supervisor – Utilities Administration was rejected for not meeting the minimum experience requirements. Based on the information provided, Staff recommends Ms. Angelo’s appeal be denied and uphold the rejection of her application stating she does not meet the minimum experience requirements for the position of Supervisor – Utilities Administration.

After review and discussion, the Commission denied Ms. Angelo’s appeal and upheld the rejection of her application stating she does not meet the minimum experience requirements for the position of Supervisor – Utilities Administration.

RCA – Remove name from consideration for Fire Inspector (EP)

At its meeting on Wednesday, February 7, 2018, Mr. Jay Herring’s name was added to the eligible list for the position of Fire Inspector. Toledo Fire and Rescue – Fire Prevention Bureau verified through the Ohio Department of Public Safety – Ohio Emergency Medical Services website that Mr. Herring was not listed as having any active certifications. Therefore, based upon Civil Service Rule 60.05 (e), Staff recommends that Mr. Jay Herring’s name be removed from the certified eligible list for Fire Inspector.

After review and discussion, the Commission agreed that Mr. Jay Herring’s name should be removed from the certified eligible list for Fire Inspector pursuant to Civil Service Rule 60.05 (e).

RCA – Expiration of Current Eligible List for Fire Inspector (EP)

The eligible list for Fire Inspector was established by the Commission on February 7, 2018. There are only two (2) names on the eligible list, pursuant to Civil Service Rule 60.02 an eligible list may be expired if there are “fewer than three (3) names remaining.” Therefore, the Toledo Fire and Rescue Department requests that the eligible list for Fire Inspector be expired and the position will be opened up for promotion and recruitment at a later time.

After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request from the Toledo Fire and Rescue Department to expire the Fire Inspector eligible list pursuant to Civil Service Rule 60.02.

RCA – Clerical Skills Test – Police Communications Specialist Typing Tests (KM)

The following individuals completed the clerical skills test for the position of Police Communications Specialist on Monday, May 7, 2018, Tuesday, May 8, 2018 and Wednesday, May 9, 2018. A passing score for Police Communications Specialist is 30 wpm. (An * denotes a passing score.)

<u>Last Name</u>	<u>First Name</u>	<u>Typing</u>
Akpaka	Melody	36*
Allen	Mary	32*
Ammerman	Madison	45*
Anderson	Sierra	37*
Awada	Hussein	33*
Box	Ashley	36*
Brentlinger	Kellie	40*
Brice	Nathaniel	27
Bricker	Jessica	42*
Brown	Taylor	26
Buehrer	Trevor	40*
Byrd	Alicia	19
Cameron	Kantrell	35*

(continued to next page)

OTHER:

RCA – Clerical Skills Test – Police Communications Specialist Typing Tests (KM) (cont'd)

<u>Last Name</u>	<u>First Name</u>	<u>Typing</u>
Carter	Whitney	45*
Childress	Adrian	68*
Clark	Michelle	43*
Cole	Adam	69*
Conti	Linda	58*
Craft	India	42*
Cufr	Andrea	37*
Dale	Justyn	70*
Duncan	Cavanaugh	44*
Erlandsen	Marjorie	14
Fleig	Veronica	30*
Frey	Gina	61*
Gaiter	Anthony	16
Garcia	Mariah	31*
Good	Janet	39*
Graham	Kimberly	48*
Gray El	Jasmin	56*
Greely	T'shayla	32*
Guilford	Kenasia	40*
Harwick	Kerensa	43*
Hawkins	Angela	0
Hickman	Audrey	26
Hoffman	Brittany	51*
Hunt	Ashley	40*
Jaeger	Emily	43*
Kennedy	Lauren	48*
Kennie, Jr.	John	21
Lynch	Rohnnie	48*
Mariano	Dyan	48*
Martin	Lindsey	45*
McGee	Terrance	29
Miller	Kathleen	41*
Moore	Krystin	56*
Moreland	Marlanea	34*
Morrow	Chelsea	44*
Nelson	Christopher	60*
Nelson	Akena	26
Noles	Jon'Tia	36*
Parker	Charvette	52*
Pecina	Bianca	34*
Permar	Kelsey	74*
Permar	Andrew	70*
Purvins	Jacqueline	64*
Reef	Mark	44*
Sanders	Robyne	40*
Savage	Charlotte	21
Schmidlin	Jonathan	50*

(continued to next page)

OTHER:

RCA – Clerical Skills Test – Police Communications Specialist Typing Tests (KM) (cont'd)

Searcy	Sharieka	35*
Smith	Curtis	50*
Swanger	Sandra	14
Turner	Charles	29
Tyson	Heather	32*
Vargyas	Adrienne	38*
Vascik	Aaron	23
Waingrow	Gabrielle	23
Waldrop	Stephanie	54*
Walter	Deanna	44*
White	Cynthia	48*
White	Tiffany	35*
Williams-Adams	Kimberly	35*
Zunk	Abigail	67*

It is recommended that the above scores be approved and placed on record for two (2) years as provided for in the Civil Service Skills Testing Policy.

After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request as recommended. Scores will be placed on record for two (2) years as provided for in the Civil Service Skills Testing Policy.

RCA – Clerical Skills Test – Secretary 2 (Law) Typing Tests (EP)

The following individuals completed the clerical skills test for the position of Secretary 2 (Law) on Monday, May 14, 2018 and Tuesday, May 15, 2018. A passing score for Police Communications Specialist is 45 wpm. (An * denotes a passing score.)

<u>Last Name</u>	<u>First Name</u>	<u>WPM</u>
Ali	Shahnaz	75*
Gist	Vary	34
Hartford	Sarah	44
Large	Kathryn	75*
Lee	Cherhea	45*
Martnez	Gina	53*
Merritt	Kay	65*
Smith	Melisa	47*

For clarification purposes, the Secretary 2 class specification was revised and approved at the March 21, 2018 meeting. The requested change was for the words per minute from **60** to **45** for **General Secretarial**. This change should also be reflective to the **Law** subsection from **60** to **45**.

The Secretary 2 class specification was revised and approved at the March 21, 2018 meeting. The change from 60 to 45 words per minute (wpm) will apply to both the General Secretarial and Law subsections.

It is recommended that the above scores be approved and placed on record for two (2) years as provided for in the Civil Service Skills Testing Policy.

After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request as recommended. Scores will be placed on record for two (2) years as provided for in the Civil Service Skills Testing Policy.

INFORMATIONAL PURPOSES:

None

APPEARANCES:

Alan Bannister

Abed Semaan, Acting Commissioner

Barbara Dickerson

EXTENSIONS:

Fire Lieutenant and **Fire Captain** eligible lists are set to expire on August 16, 2018. Staff requests that both lists are extended to the full two (2) years allowed by Civil Service Rules. If approved, the Fire Lieutenant List will expire on November 16, 2018 and the Fire Captain eligible list will expire December 21, 2018.

The Commission approved the Fire Lieutenant and Fire Captain promotional eligible list to be extended to the full two (2) years allowed by Civil Service. Fire Lieutenant will expire on November 16, 2018 and Fire Captain will expire on December 21, 2018.

HEARINGS:

None

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 2:53 p.m.