

**OFFICE OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
One Government Center, Suite 1920
August 15, 2018 10:00 a.m.**

A regular meeting of the Toledo Civil Service Commission was held at the time and place specified above.

Present: Commission President Dr. Marjorie L. Holt
Commission Member Wilma D. Brown
Commission Member Justice G. Johnson, Jr., Esq. – Excused Absence
Victoria Coleman, Manager – Administrative Services
Erica S. Powell, Secretary-Toledo Civil Service Commission
Kelly Murphy, Administrative Analyst 2
Joshua Curry, Administrative Analyst 2 – Excused Absence
Alan Bannister, Director – Office of Diversity & Inclusion

Review and approval of minutes from Regular Meeting August 1, 2018. A motion to approve the minutes was made, seconded and approved unanimously at the August 15, 2018 Regular Meeting.

ANNOUNCEMENTS:

2018-00152 Industrial Waste Control Specialist (NCP) announce Thursday, August 16, 2018 to Wednesday, August 22, 2018

ELIGIBLE LISTS:

2018-00046 Senior Equipment Repair Technician (CP) add Braun and Curtis

2018-00068 Manager-Public Services (Recreation) (NCR) add Cole, Crosby, Dar, George, Harper, Miller, Murphy, Nunn and Warren

2018-00080 Tree Maintenance Worker (CR) add Bohland and Fletcher

2018-00157 Administrative Analyst 3(Finance) (NCP/NCR) add Boehnlein, Mason, Rucki and Tsenuokpor

2018-00162 Administrative Specialist 2 (Finance-STAX) add Majoros, Martinez, Meylakhov, Moore and Saunders

2017-00103 Clerk Specialist II (NCP/NCR) add Kulwicki, Golembiewski, Ali, Reynolds, Jacobs, Frey, Dilworth, Stokes, Berry, Whitaker, Lippian, Keller-Pifer, Hayes, Fredericks, Rowlson, Regalado, Harp, McCoy, Estrada, Pinson, Hartford, Fox, Sugg, Lee, Croley, Gaglio, Skipper, Boos, Laraway, Ellis-Manning, and Luna

2018-00122 Administrative Analyst 2 – Utilities Administration/Management Relations (NCP/NCR) add Adams, Alexander, Austin, Beasley, Berry, Boehnlein, Boraby, Contreras-Harris, Emley, Flores, Forrester, Granados, Harris, Kippian, Meehan, Mick, Nauden, Nunn, Pacer, Peace, Ragans-Williams, Rucki, Spurlock, Stainbrook, Szentkirayli, Tilman, Wagenknecht, Watts, Wiley, and Zimmerman

CLASSIFICATION REPORTS:

Heavy Equipment Mechanic (Revise) (Division of Solid Waste-Landfill Operations) (KM) - **Approved**

Administrator-Administrative Services 2 (Field Operations/DPU) (Revise) (Department of Public Utilities) (JC) - **Approved**

Commission-Administrative Services (Revise) (Department of Finance, Division of Taxation) (VC) - **Approved**

CLASSIFICATION REPORTS: (cont'd)

Administrator-Administrative Services 2 (Revise) (Department of Finance, Division of Taxation) (VC) - **Approved**

Administrator-Administrative Services 1 (Revise) (Department of Finance, Division of Taxation) (VC) - **Approved**

Administrative Services Officer 1 (Revise) (Department of Finance, Division of Taxation) (VC) - **Approved**

Administrative Specialist 2 (Revise) (Department of Finance, Division of Taxation) (VC) - **Approved**

OTHER:

RCA – Disqualification of Eligible – Fire Fighter – (KM) *APPEARANCES*****

Currently, there are fourteen (14) applicants who are 35 years of age or older on the eligible list for the position of Fire Fighter. Therefore, these individuals exceed the maximum hiring age for the position of Fire Fighter; and there is just and reasonable cause that indicates they should be disqualified from the eligible list. Based on the facts and analysis given, it is recommended to the Commission that these individuals be removed from the eligible list pursuant to Rule 60.00, Section 60.03 “Disqualification of Eligible” and the removal of their names from the eligibility list pursuant to Section 60.05 “Removal from Eligibility List” as well as Rule 40.03A “Age Limits”.

The Commission agreed that all of the candidates, who appeared before them today, exceed the maximum age requirement for appointment to the position of Fire Fighter. Therefore, their names will be removed from the eligible list pursuant to Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.03, 60.05 and 40.03A.

RCA – Disqualification of Eligible – Fire Fighter – (KM) *APPEARANCES*****

Currently, there are twenty-one (21) applicants who are 35 years of age or older on the eligible list for the position of Fire Fighter. Therefore, these individuals exceed the maximum hiring age for the position of Fire Fighter; and there is just and reasonable cause that indicates they should be disqualified from the eligible list. Based on the facts and analysis given, it is recommended to the Commission that these individuals be removed from the eligible list pursuant to Rule 60.00, Section 60.03 “Disqualification of Eligible” and the removal of their names from the eligibility list pursuant to Section 60.05 “Removal from Eligibility List” as well as Rule 40.03A “Age Limits”.

The Commission agreed that all of the candidates, who appeared before them today, exceed the maximum age requirement for appointment to the position of Fire Fighter. Therefore, their names will be removed from the eligible list pursuant to Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.03, 60.05 and 40.03A.

RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Administrative Analyst 3 – Rachelle Bundy (KM)

Rachelle Bundy has appealed the rejection of her application for Administrative Analyst 3 for not meeting the education requirement. Based upon the information provided, Staff recommends that Ms. Bundy’s appeal be denied and the rejection of her application is upheld for failing to meet the minimum education requirements.

After review and discussion, the Commission denied Ms. Bundy’s appeal and upheld the rejection of her application for failing to meet the minimum education requirements.

RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Administrative Analyst 3 – Larry Wagner (KM)

Larry Wagner has appealed the rejection of his application for Administrative Analyst 3 for not meeting the education requirement. Based on the information provided, Staff recommends that the Commission grant the appeal of Mr. Wagner deeming his application as qualified for the position of Administrative Analyst 3.

After review and discussion, the Commission granted the appeal of Mr. Wagner and deemed his application as qualified for the position of Administrative Analyst 3.

OTHER:

RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Manager-Public Services (Parks & Recreation) – Marilyn DuFour and Beatrice Miringu (KM)

Marilyn DuFour and Beatrice Miringu’s applications for Manager-Public Services were rejected. Based on the information provided, Staff recommends that the appeals for Ms. DuFour and Ms. Miringu be denied stating that they did not apply when the position was posted for promotional candidates.

After review and discussion, the Commission denied the appeals of Ms. DuFour and Ms. Miringu because they did not apply when the position was posted for promotional candidates.

RCA – Remove Names from consideration for Fire Fighter (KM)

At its meeting on Wednesday, March 15, 2017, there were eighty-three (83) names added to the eligible list for the position of Fire Fighter. When the candidates were contacted by the background investigation unit, some requested to be removed from the eligibility list. Based on Civil Service Rule 60.05 Removal from Eligible List, Staff recommends that the eighty-three (83) names be removed from the certified eligible list for Fire Fighter.

After review and discussion, the Commission agreed that the eighty-three (83) names should be removed from the certified eligible list for Fire Fighter pursuant to Civil Service Rule 60.05.

RCA – Remove Name from consideration for Fire Fighter (KM)

At its meeting on Wednesday, March 15, 2017, Mr. Zahid Khan’s name was added to the eligible list for the position of Fire Fighter. Mr. Khan was contacted by this office via email to continue in the hiring process; therefore, he was invited to complete the Fire Fighter Mile (FFM) through National Testing Network (NTN). The FFM is a physical ability test that is used to determine a candidate’s ability to perform the duties of Fire Fighter. This test is required in order to proceed in the hiring process. The names of all of the candidates that were invited to complete the FFM were sent to NTN. Upon receipt of this list, NTN informed the City that Mr. Khan was permanently removed from their system for fraudulent behavior. Based upon Civil Service Rule 60.05 Removal from Eligible List, Staff recommends that Mr. Khan’s name be removed from the certified eligible list.

After review, discussion and pursuant to Civil Service Rule 60.05, the Commission agreed that Mr. Khan’s name should be removed from the certified eligible list for Fire Fighter due to his fraudulent behavior.

RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Administrative Analyst 2 – UA/MR – Charles Campbell (JC)

The application of Charles Campbell for Administrative Analyst 2 – Utilities Administration/Management Relations was rejected for not meeting the minimum education requirement. Based on the information provided, Staff recommends to the Commission that his appeal be granted and deem his application as qualified for the position of Administrative Analyst 2 – UA/MR.

After review and discussion, the Commission granted Mr. Campbell’s appeal and deemed his application as qualified for the position of Administrative Analyst 2 – Utilities Administration/Management Relations.

RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Administrative Analyst 2 – UA/MR – Leslie Albanese (JC)

The application of Leslie Albanese for Administrative Analyst 2 – Utilities Administration/Management Relations was rejected for not meeting the minimum education requirement. Based on the information provided, Staff recommends to the Commission that her appeal be denied and uphold the rejection of her application for the position of Administrative Analyst 2 – UA/MR.

After review and discussion, the Commission denied the appeal of Ms. Albanese and upheld the rejection of her application for the position of Administrative Analyst 2 – Utilities Administration/Management Relations.

OTHER:

RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Administrative Analyst 2 – UA/MR – Edith Kippenhan (JC)

The application of Edith Kippenhan for Administrative Analyst 2 – Utilities Administration/Management Relations was rejected for not meeting the minimum education requirement. Based on the information provided, Staff recommends to the Commission that her appeal be granted and deem her application as qualified for the position of Administrative Analyst 2 – UA/MR.

After review and discussion, the Commission granted the appeal of Ms. Kippenhan and deemed her application as qualified for the position of Administrative Analyst 2 – Utilities Administration/Management Relations.

RCA – Clerical Skills Test – Clerk Specialist II (JC)

The following candidates completed the clerical skills tests on Monday, July 30, 2018, Tuesday, July 31, 2018 and Thursday, August 2, 2018 for the position of Clerk Specialist II. A passing score for Clerk Specialist II is 45 wpm. (An * denotes a passing score.)

<u>Last Name</u>	<u>First Name</u>	<u>Score</u>
Bargy	Catherine	43
Bell	Jasmine	26
Berry	Nicole	58*
Bills	Judith	39
Boos	Kimberly	45*
Braun	Christina	39
Brown-Biddle	LaKesha	25
Cortez	Ann	40
Dickerson	Barbara	40
Dilworth	Kelly	60*
Ellis-Manning	Glenda	45*
Estrada	Pauline	48*
Fox	Camille	46*
Fredericks	Holly	54*
Golembiewski	Joann	78*
Gordon	Roberta	42
Grant	Dena	32
Gray	Kristin	31
Harp	Diann	52
Hartford	Sarah	46*
Hayes	Marcella	36
Hayes	Mary	57*
Hickman	Audrey	24
Hicks	Shatisher	30
Howat	Jillianne	49*
Huerta	Melissa	36
Keller-Pifer	Shelly	57*
Kulwicki	Dustin	86*
Laraway	Stephanie	45*
Lewandowski	Rebecca	28
Lippian	Brett	57*

(continued on next page)

OTHER:

RCA – Clerical Skills Test – Clerk Specialist II (JC)

The following candidates completed the clerical skills tests on Monday, July 30, 2018, Tuesday, July 31, 2018 and Thursday, August 2, 2018 for the position of Clerk Specialist II. A passing score for Clerk Specialist II is 45 wpm. (An * denotes a passing score.)

<u>Last Name</u>	<u>First Name</u>	<u>Score</u>
Luna	Kassandra	45*
McCann	Ashley	18
McCoy	Toni	50*
Meehan	Julie	41
Montague	Michelle	23
Morris	Chalise	27
Neary	Cynthia	35
Nunnally	Jennette	41
Pinson	Loree	46*
Reynolds	Patricia	73*
Rogers	Cortney	41
Scott	Esteea	31
Sims	Dominique	32
Stokes	Marquita	59*
Sugg	Elizabeth	45*
Suydam	Kathryn	43
Tirone	Lisa	24
Townsend	Carla	37
Wade	Amanda	41
Walters	Margaret	44
Whitaker	Suzanne	58*

It is recommended that the above scores be approved and placed on record for two (2) years as provided for in the Civil Service Skills Testing Policy.

After review and discussion, the Commission approved the request as recommended. Scores will be placed on record for two (2) years as provided for in the Civil Service Skills Testing Policy.

INFORMATIONAL PURPOSES:

Next Civil Service meeting is scheduled for August 29, 2018 at 10:00 a.m. The meeting scheduled for September 5, 2018 is cancelled.

APPEARANCES:

Six (6) Disqualification of Eligible – Fire Fighter (Age)

Eduardo Ramirez

Valerie Harmon

Phillip Smith

Mark Seibert

Cory Taylor

John Yuschak

The Commission agreed that all of the candidates who appeared before them today exceed the maximum age requirement for appointment to the position of Fire Fighter. Therefore, their names will be removed from the eligible list pursuant to Civil Service Rule 60.00, Section 60.03, 60.05 and 40.03A.

Armand Gary – scheduled for August 29, 2018

Lindsay Czerniak has requested to appear before the Commission to address the rejection of her application to Administrative Analyst 2 – Utilities Administration/Management Relations. If the Commission allows the appearance, she will be scheduled to appear at the next scheduled Civil Service Commission meeting.

The Commission granted Lindsay Czerniak's request to appear before the Commission regarding the rejection of her application. She will appear on Wednesday, August 29, 2018.

EXTENSIONS:

None

HEARINGS:

None

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 11:20 a.m.