

**OFFICE OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
One Government Center, Suite 1920
October 17, 2018 2:00 p.m.**

A regular meeting of the Toledo Civil Service Commission was held at the time and place specified above.

Present: Commission President Dr. Marjorie L. Holt
Commission Member Wilma D. Brown – **Excused Absence**
Commission Member Justice G. Johnson, Jr., Esq.
Victoria Coleman, Manager – Administrative Services
Alan Bannister, Director – Office of Diversity & Inclusion
Erica S. Powell, Secretary-Toledo Civil Service Commission
Kelly Murphy, Administrative Analyst 2
Joshua Curry, Administrative Analyst 2
Abby Emlinger, Administrative Analyst 2
Angela Seiple, Administrative Analyst 2

Review and approval of minutes from Regular Meeting October 3, 2018. A motion to approve the minutes was made, seconded and approved unanimously at the October 17, 2018 Regular Meeting.

ANNOUNCEMENTS:

None

ELIGIBLE LISTS:

2018 Police Officer Eligible List (See attached report) - **Approved**

2017-00343 Water Reclamation Operator (NCP/NCR) add Cully and Pope

2018-00183 Chemist/Bacteriologist (Local 20) (NCP/NCR) add Berman, Cuevas Valdespino, Elmalhoud, Fletcher, Jambulapati, Johnson, Mandell, Savino, and Stechshulte

2018-00068 Manager-Public Services (NCP/NCR) add Brown, Cassi, Clayborne-Spence, Crosby, DuFour, Ferrell, Greene, Griffin, Harris, Jackson, Murphy, Myers, Nunn, Ohl, Parish, Presser, Robinson, Steude, Warren and Wilson

2018-00123 Safety and Training Specialist (NCR) add Chouinard

CLASSIFICATION REPORTS:

Administrative Analyst 2 to Manager-Administrative Services (Selection and Evaluation) (Dept. of HR) (VC) - **Approved**

OTHER:

RCA – Request for Reinstatement – Police Officer – Dustin Kindle (AS) *APPEARANCE W/ ATTORNEY*****

Mr. Kindle was hired as a Police Officer on July 7, 2017 and entered the Toledo Police Academy. Mr. Kindle graduated from the Toledo Police Academy on February 2, 2018 and resigned from employment with the City of Toledo on August 26, 2018. Therefore, Mr. Kindle was still a probationary employee at the time of his resignation. Based on the aforementioned information, it is recommended that the Commission deny Mr. Kindle's placement on the Police Officer reinstatement list pursuant to Civil Service Rule 60.17.

After further review, discussion and appearance of Attorney Yvonne Trevino and Mr. Kindle, the Commission upheld their decision to deny Mr. Kindle's request for reinstatement to Police Officer. At the time of his resignation, Mr. Kindle was not a "permanent" employee nor did he give a two (2) week notice pursuant to Civil Service Rule 60.17 and 80.09.

RCA – Disqualification of Eligible – Tree Service Worker – Jason Major – (KM) *APPEARANCE*****

Former City of Toledo employee, Jason Major, applied to the position of Tree Service Worker and after review of his application; he could potentially be placed on the competitive eligible list for the position of Tree Service Worker. Mr. Major was resigned from his employment with the City of Toledo while in a Last Chance Agreement; therefore, there is just and reasonable cause that he should be disqualified from the recruitment process for the position of Tree Service Worker. Based on the facts given, it is recommended to the Commission that Mr. Major be notified and be given an opportunity to be heard regarding his disqualification for appointment per Rule 60.00, Section 60.03 "Disqualification of Eligible". A hearing will be scheduled.

After further review, discussion and appearance by Mr. Jason Major, the Commission agreed that there is just and reasonable cause for Mr. Major to be disqualified from the recruitment process for the position of Tree Service Worker.

RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Administrative Analyst I (Employee Relations) – Larry Wagner (KM) *APPEARANCE*****

Larry Wagner has appealed the rejection of his application for Administrative Analyst 1 (Employee Relations) for not meeting the experience requirement. Based upon the information provided, Staff recommends to the Commission that Mr. Wagner's appeal be denied and the rejection of his application is upheld for failing to meet the minimum experience requirements.

After further review, discussion and appearance by Mr. Wagner, the Commission upheld the rejection of his application due to not meeting the minimum experience requirements.

RCA – Request for Reinstatement – Brenda Daniel (AE)

Brenda Daniel began her employment with the City of Toledo on February 8, 2013 as a Secretary 2 with the Department of Public Utilities. Since her hire date, Ms. Daniel was employed with the City of Toledo as a Secretary 2 and an Administrative Specialist. She resigned on October 19, 2017. Brenda Daniel submitted a request for reinstatement on September 27, 2018 and it is timely. Therefore, it is recommended that the Commission approve Ms. Daniel's request and approve her placement on the reinstatement lists for any and all classified position which she held permanently in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.17.

After review and discussion, the Commission approved Ms. Daniel's request for reinstatement. Therefore, her name will be placed on the Administrative Specialist and Secretary 2 reinstatement lists.

OTHER:

RCA – Temporary Fire Inspector (VC)

The Toledo Fire and Rescue Department respectfully requests approval of a temporary Fire Inspector position to perform inspections at the Cleveland-Cliffs construction site in accordance with section 60.13. The Office of the Mayor and AFSCME Local 7 have reviewed and approved of this request on an emergency basis.

After review and discussion, the Commission approved the Toledo Fire and Rescue Departments request for a temporary Fire Inspector on an emergency basis in accordance with Civil Service Rule 60.13.

RCA – Appeal of Rejection for Senior Water Reclamation Maintenance Worker – Thomas Sloan (JC)

The application for Mr. Thomas Sloan for Senior Water Reclamation Maintenance Worker was rejected for not meeting the minimum experience requirements. Based on the information provided, Staff recommends to the Commission that Mr. Sloan's appeal be granted and deem his application as qualified stating he does meet the minimum experience requirements for the position of Senior Water Reclamation Maintenance Worker.

After review and discussion, the Commission granted Mr. Sloan's appeal and deemed his application as qualified stating he does meet the minimum experience requirements for the position of Senior Water Reclamation Maintenance Worker

RCA – Appeal of Rejection for Senior Water Reclamation Maintenance Worker – Adam Lewis (JC)

The application for Mr. Adam Lewis for Senior Water Reclamation Maintenance Worker was rejected for not meeting the minimum experience requirements. Based on the information provided, Staff recommends to the Commission that Mr. Lewis' appeal be granted and deem his application as qualified stating he does meet the minimum experience requirements for the position of Senior Water Reclamation Maintenance Worker.

After review and discussion, the Commission granted Mr. Lewis' appeal and deemed his application as qualified stating he does meet the minimum experience requirements for the position of Senior Water Reclamation Maintenance Worker

RCA – Appeal of Rejection for Chemist/Bacteriologist (Local 20) – Lauren Hamilton (JC)

The application for Ms. Lauren Hamilton for the position of Chemist/Bacteriologist (Local 20) was rejected for not meeting the minimum education requirements. Based on the information provided, Staff recommends to the Commission that Ms. Hamilton's appeal be denied and uphold the rejection of her application stating she does not meet the minimum education requirements for the position of Chemist/Bacteriologist (Local 20).

After review and discussion, the Commission denied Ms. Hamilton's appeal and upheld the rejection of her application stating she does not meet the minimum education requirements for the position of Chemist/Bacteriologist.

RCA – Appeal of Rejection for Chemist/Bacteriologist (Local 20) – Alycia Pittenger (JC)

The application for Ms. Alycia Pittenger for the position of Chemist/Bacteriologist (Local 20) was rejected for not meeting the minimum education requirements. Based on the information provided, Staff recommends to the Commission that Ms. Pittenger's appeal be granted and deem her application as qualified stating she does meet the minimum education requirements for the position of Chemist/Bacteriologist (Local 20).

After review and discussion, the Commission granted Ms. Pittenger's appeal and deemed her application as qualified stating she does meet the minimum education requirements for the position of Chemist/Bacteriologist (Local 20).

OTHER:

RCA – Appeal of Rejection for Chemist/Bacteriologist (Local 20) – Robert Becker (JC)

The application for Mr. Robert Becker for the position of Chemist/Bacteriologist (Local 20) was rejected for not meeting the minimum experience requirements. Based on the information provided, Staff recommends to the Commission that Mr. Becker's appeal be granted and deem his application as qualified stating he does meet the minimum experience requirements for the position of Chemist/Bacteriologist (Local 20).

After review and discussion, the Commission granted Mr. Becker's appeal and deemed his application as qualified stating he does meet the minimum education requirements for the position of Chemist/Bacteriologist (Local 20).

RCA – Appeal of Rejection for Chemist/Bacteriologist (Local 20) – Brianne Nowak (JC)

The application for Ms. Brianne Nowak for the position of Chemist/Bacteriologist (Local 20) was rejected for not meeting the minimum experience requirements. Based on the information provided, Staff recommends to the Commission that Ms. Nowak's appeal be granted and deem her application as qualified stating she does meet the minimum experience requirements for the position of Chemist/Bacteriologist (Local 20).

After review and discussion, the Commission granted Ms. Nowak's appeal and deemed her application as qualified stating she does meet the minimum education requirements for the position of Chemist/Bacteriologist (Local 20).

RCA – Remove name from consideration for Fire Fighter (KM)

At its meeting on Wednesday, March 15, 2017, Nicholas Johnson, Fu Sun and Danielle Carr were added to the eligible list for the position of Fire Fighter. Mr. Johnson, Mr. Sun and Ms. Carr contacted the background investigation team stating that they would like have their names removed from the eligible list for the position of Fire Fighter. Based upon Civil Service Rule 60.05 Removal of Eligible List, Staff recommends that Mr. Johnson, Mr. Sun and Ms. Carr's names be removed from the certified eligible list.

After review and discussion, the Commission approved Mr. Johnson, Mr. Sun and Ms. Carr's names to be removed from the certified eligible list for the position of Fire Fighter pursuant to Civil Service Rule 60.05.

RCA – Submit Late Application – Police Officer – Julius Simmons (KM)

The position of Police Officer was posted from July 15, 2018 through September 30, 2018 for recruitment; therefore, the position was posted on the City of Toledo's Job Opportunities webpage as well as governmentjobs.com. Mr. Simmons did not complete the application prior to the extended deadline. Therefore, Mr. Simmons is requesting the opportunity to submit a late application. Mr. Simmons completed the NTN test for the position of Firefighter in 2016; however, he did not complete the required City of Toledo application for the position of Firefighter. Based on the facts given, Staff recommends that the Commission deny Mr. Simmons' request to submit a late application.

After review and discussion, the Commission denied Mr. Simmons' request to submit a late application for the position of Police Officer.

RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Manager-Public Services (Youth and Recreation) – Aaron Bates (KM)

Aaron Bates has appealed the rejection of his application for Manager-Public Services (Youth and Recreation) for not meeting the minimum experience requirements. Based upon the information provided, Staff recommends that the Commission deny the appeal of Mr. Bates stating that he does not meet the minimum experience requirements for the position of Manager-Public Services (Youth and Recreation).

After review and discussion, the Commission denied the appeal of Mr. Bates and upheld the rejection stating he does not meet the minimum experience requirements for the position of Manager-Public Services (Youth & Recreation).

OTHER:

RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Manager-Public Services (Youth and Recreation) – Kristen Angelo (KM)

Kristen Angelo has appealed the rejection of her application for Manager-Public Services (Youth and Recreation) for not meeting the minimum experience requirements. Based upon the information provided, Staff recommends that the Commission deny the appeal of Ms. Angelo stating that she does not meet the minimum experience requirements for the position of Manager-Public Services (Youth and Recreation).

After review and discussion, the Commission denied the appeal of Ms. Angelo and upheld the rejection stating she does not meet the minimum experience requirements for the position of Manager-Public Services (Youth & Recreation).

RCA – Waiver of CDL Requirements – Safety and Training Specialist (KM)

Director Paul Rasmusson, of the Department of Public Service is requesting a temporary waiver of the Class B CDL requirement for the classification of Safety and Training Specialist in the Department of Public Service. Staff recommends that the Commission grant the temporary waiver of the Class B CDL requirement for the classification of Safety and Training Specialist in the Department of Public Service.

After review and discussion, the Commission granted the temporary waiver of a Class B CDL requirement for the classification of Safety and Training Specialist per the request from Director Paul Rasmusson, Department of Public Service.

RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Safety and Training Specialist – Anthony Foster (KM)

Anthony Foster has appealed the rejection of his application for Safety and Training Specialist for not meeting the minimum education requirements. Based upon the information provided, Staff recommends that the Commission grant the appeal of Mr. Foster and deem his application as qualified for the position of Safety and Training Specialist.

After review and discussion, the Commission granted Mr. Foster’s appeal and deemed his application as qualified for the position of Safety and Training Specialist.

RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Safety and Training Specialist – Scott Redway (KM)

Scott Redway has appealed the rejection of his application for Safety and Training Specialist for not meeting the minimum education requirements. Based upon the information provided, Staff recommends that the Commission grant the appeal of Mr. Redway and deem his application as qualified for the position of Safety and Training Specialist.

After review and discussion, the Commission granted Mr. Redway’s appeal and deemed his application as qualified for the position of Safety and Training Specialist.

RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Safety and Training Specialist – Lucas Smigielski (KM)

Lucas Smigielski has appealed the rejection of his application for Safety and Training Specialist for not meeting the minimum education requirements. Based upon the information provided, Staff recommends that the Commission grant the appeal of Mr. Smigielski and deem his application as qualified for the position of Safety and Training Specialist.

After review and discussion, the Commission granted Mr. Smigielski’s appeal and deemed his application as qualified for the position of Safety and Training Specialist.

OTHER:

RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Safety and Training Specialist – Greg Thompson (KM)

Greg Thompson has appealed the rejection of his application for Safety and Training Specialist for not meeting the minimum education and experience requirements. Based upon the information provided, Staff recommends that the Commission grant the appeal of Mr. Thompson and deem his application as qualified for the position of Safety and Training Specialist.

After review and discussion, the Commission granted Mr. Thompson’s appeal and deemed his application as qualified for the position of Safety and Training Specialist.

RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Safety and Training Specialist – David Villarreal (KM)

David Villarreal has appealed the rejection of his application for Safety and Training Specialist for not meeting the minimum education and experience requirements. Based upon the information provided, Staff recommends that the Commission grant the appeal of Mr. Villarreal and deem his application as qualified for the position of Safety and Training Specialist.

After review and discussion, the Commission granted Mr. Villarreal’s appeal and deemed his application as qualified for the position of Safety and Training Specialist.

RCA – Appeal of Rejection of Application for Safety and Training Specialist – Clifton Beasley (KM)

Clifton Beasley has appealed the rejection of his application for Safety and Training Specialist for not meeting the minimum education and experience requirements. Based upon the information provided, Staff recommends Commission action in determining Mr. Beasley’s qualifications.

After review and discussion, the Commission granted Mr. Beasley’s appeal and deemed his application as qualified for the position of Safety and Training Specialist.

APPEARANCES:

Dustin Kindle w/ Attorney Yvonne Trevino & Officer Cori Biglin, Union Steward– reinstatement to the position of Police Officer denied

Jason Major – Disqualification of Eligible – Tree Service Worker

Larry Wagner – Appeal rejection of application for Administrative Analyst 1 (HR/ER)

EXTENSIONS:

None

HEARINGS:

None

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 3:30 p.m.